

The crisis of the written press: A bibliographical review to rethink it from Latin America

La crisis de la prensa escrita: una revisión bibliográfica para repensarla desde Latinoamérica

A crise da imprensa escrita: uma revisão bibliográfica para repensá-la a partir da visão da América Latina

Facundo Suenzo, Northwestern University, Evanston, Estados Unidos
(Facundo@u.northwestern.edu)

Pablo J. Boczkowski, Northwestern University, Evanston, Estados Unidos
(pjb9@northwestern.edu)

Eugenia Mitchelstein, Universidad de San Andrés, Buenos Aires, Argentina
(emitchelstein@udesa.edu.ar)

ABSTRACT | In this article we provide a critical analysis of 132 recent publications on the crisis of the written press. We find that the discussion of the phenomenon has been organized mainly in three thematic groups: the economic and financial dimension to understand the crisis, the description and analysis of the labor dynamics of journalists, and the crisis' possible impact on the press' social role and values. Research has been heterogeneous in terms of their conceptual approaches and the set of techniques used: mostly case studies and —to a lesser extent— comparative studies. Moreover, they have mainly focused on the productive dimensions of information, leaving mostly aside the reception of news and the consumption of newspapers. Finally, we outline a possible framework for rethinking the crisis in this article, but also a future research agenda, from and in Latin America.

KEYWORDS: written press; newspapers; news consumption; media consumption; journalism; crisis of written press.

HOW TO CITE

Suenzo, F., Boczkowski, P., & Mitchelstein, E. (2020). The crisis of the written press: A bibliographical review to rethink it from Latin America. *Cuadernos.info*, (47), 1-25.
<https://doi.org/10.7764/cdi.47.1867>

RESUMEN | *En este artículo efectuamos un análisis crítico de 132 publicaciones recientes sobre la crisis de la prensa escrita. Encontramos que la discusión sobre el fenómeno se ha organizado principalmente en torno a tres grupos temáticos: la dimensión económica y financiera para entender la crisis, la descripción y el análisis de las dinámicas laborales de los periodistas, y el posible impacto de la crisis en el rol social y los valores de la prensa. Las investigaciones han sido heterogéneas en cuanto a sus enfoques conceptuales y al conjunto de técnicas utilizadas: fundamentalmente estudios de caso y, en menor medida, estudios comparativos. Además, se han centrado principalmente en las dimensiones productivas de la información, dejando mayormente de lado la recepción de las noticias y el consumo de diario en papel. Finalmente, en el artículo esbozamos un marco posible para repensar la crisis, pero también una agenda de investigación futura, desde y en Latinoamérica.*

PALABRAS CLAVE: *prensa escrita; diarios en papel; consumo de noticias; consumo de medios; periodismo; crisis de la prensa escrita.*

RESUMO | Neste artigo apresentamos uma análise crítica de 132 publicações recentes sobre a crise da imprensa escrita. Verificamos que a discussão do fenômeno foi organizada principalmente em três grupos temáticos: a dimensão econômica e financeira para a compreensão da crise; a descrição e análise da dinâmica laboral dos jornalistas; e o possível impacto da crise sobre o papel social, e os valores da imprensa. A investigação tem sido heterogênea em termos das suas abordagens conceituais e do conjunto de técnicas utilizadas: principalmente estudos de caso e, em menor grau, estudos comparativos. Além disso, concentraram-se principalmente nas dimensões produtivas da informação, deixando de lado sobretudo a recepção das notícias e o consumo de jornais de papel. Finalmente, no artigo esboçamos um possível quadro para repensar a crise, mas também uma agenda de investigação futura, desde e na América Latina.

PALAVRAS CHAVE: *imprensa escrita; jornais de papel; consumo de notícias; consumo da mídia; jornalismo; crise da imprensa escrita.*

INTRODUCTION

The role of newspapers in contemporary societies has been widely described. The press knew how to shape the material representations of the public sphere (Habermas, 2015) and create a fundamental link to what Anderson (2006) defined as national identities. However, in recent decades, print newspapers have suffered dramatic drops in readership and revenue, as well as a reduction in staff and resources. In Latin America, the circulation of several titles has been affected, and some even have completely disappeared. In Venezuela, for example, the newspaper *El Nacional* canceled its print edition in December 2018, after 75 years of circulation. Other newspapers have been strongly affected by the crisis, drastically reducing their teams. Such is the case of the *Pernambuco* newspaper, one of the oldest in circulation in Brazil, which reduced its staff by a third (Knight Center for Journalism in the Americas, 2018). This was not the case of *Jornal do Commercio*, the oldest business and economy newspaper in Rio de Janeiro, which in 2016 – with almost 190 years of existence – ceased its activities not only in its printed version, but also in its website (Vítima de la crisis..., 2016). In Argentina, after 140 years of circulation, the oldest English-written newspaper in Latin America, The Buenos Aires Herald, closed in 2018. However, those that persist are also suffering a great impact on their circulation. Specifically, between 2006 and 2016, *Clarín*, the newspaper with the largest circulation in Argentina, lost almost half of its daily net circulation, and its main competitor, *La Nación*, more than a fifth (SINCA, n.d.).

The academy has not been alien to this global phenomenon and has seek to document and explain it; although they have been very relevant, research on this topic has mainly revolved around the dynamics of news and media production.

In the first place, researchers have approached the crisis from its economic and financial dynamics; they have described the new and old business models, their productive structures and how to improve their efficiencies and yields, as well as the impact of these new models on journalism (Retegui, 2013; Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015).

In second place, research has focused on contextualizing the crisis in employment relationships and the occupational dynamics of journalism. They have investigated how economic pressure and job precariousness can lead to feelings of constant insecurity in the profession, and how such pressure calls into question traditional values such as autonomy in journalism. In other words, how these new business models collaborate in the construction of a new occupational subjectivity (Bachmann & Harlow, 2012; Davidson & Meyers, 2016; Meyers & Davidson, 2014, 2016; Sarrimo, 2017; Siapera, Papadopoulou, & Archontakis, 2015).

Third, but to a lesser extent, the decline in the written press also prompted the analysis of how the drop in circulation and consumption of the printed newspaper,

on the one hand, and the emergence of new content and information platforms, on the other, can impact the press' role in contemporary and democratic societies. Research has particularly addressed the crisis of newspapers from institutional dynamics, media ownership and the perception of their values and expectations, such as responsibility and public trust (Conboy & Eldridge, 2014; Cornia, 2016; Hassid & Repnikova, 2016; Mor & Reich, 2018; Porto, 2010; Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015). To a lesser extent, the link between journalists, the public, and media reception in this context of crisis has also been analyzed (Boczkowski, Mitchelstein, & Suenzo, 2019; Carlson & Usher, 2016; Robledo-Dioses & Atarama-Rojas, 2018; Thurman, 2018; Thurman & Fletcher, 2019).

While these three dimensions –which will later be described more deeply– have been extremely fruitful in accounting for the multiple dimensions of the printed newspaper crisis, they have been primarily focused on the Northern Hemisphere, with some highly valued exceptions (Waisbord, 2017; Schmitz Weiss, by Macedo Higgins Joyce, Harlow, & Alves, 2018; Retegui, 2020), leaving open the opportunity to explore the reasons and particularities of the phenomenon in Latin America. Based on this, this work has two objectives: first, to organize and systematize how researchers have understood and approached the crisis of the written press in recent years, its perspectives and limitations, and second, to delineate the opportunities and offer a possible framework to address the problematic from Latin America.

To achieve these objectives, we used a bibliographic review methodology (Gómez-Luna, Fernando-Navas, Aponte-Mayor, & Betancourt-Buitrago, 2014) where we prioritized for the search and analysis the publications made after the review conducted by Siles and Boczkowski (2012). Subsequently, the information was collected with different search equations¹, which yielded a total of 132 references.

The paper continues as follows: in the first section, we display the three dimensions that constitute the crisis –economic, labor and social–, to then describe the theoretical and methodological approaches that these researches have promoted and, finally, we elaborate some future lines of analysis to think about the subject from and in Latin America.

1. Se utilizaron las siguientes combinaciones: “crisis AND diario en papel”; “crisis AND prensa”; “crisis AND periodismo”, combinadas con otros vocablos comunes como “caída”, “transición”, “consumo” utilizando tanto el español como sus posibles variantes en inglés. Para este trabajo se consideraron solamente las publicaciones académicas en revistas dejando de lado actas de congresos, tesis y otros documentos.

THE DIMENSIONS OF THE CRISIS

In the context of what different researchers call the *crisis of the printed newspaper* (Siles & Boczkowski, 2012), the literature on the subject has mainly focused on understanding and explaining what happens in the *production conditions* (Verón, 2013) of the industry and, to a lesser extent, what happens with consumer practices and recognition dynamics. Recent research on this topic has revolved around the following areas of analysis: economic and financial dynamics, work and occupational logics of the profession, the social impact, and the reception of information.

The economic dimension of the crisis

The analysis of the economic factors that constitute the crisis has oscillated between those that have an impact on the definitive disappearance of the newspapers and those that allow their resistance. For Kolo, “given the costs for a newspaper publisher, revenues generated by digital media offerings on the basis of the brand’s editorial content print deficits most probably cannot be compensated. In the long term, the traditional publisher’s business model is doomed” (2016, p. 14). This business model, oriented towards a “spiral of advertising and circulation”, is for Rothmann & Koch (2014, p. 72) one of the reasons why the media have not yet been able to monetize their online sites. In this regard, Van der Burg and Van den Bulck indicate that the survival of these media will be mainly due to their ability to control costs: “as demand continues to dwindle, the papers risk eventually cost-cutting their processes and organization to level the costs” (2017, p. 107). However, Waisbord argues that the economic crisis of newspapers in Latin America has other aspects:

The economic model of the commercial press in the region was never based solely on commercial advertising, as is the case in the United States and much of Western Europe. Public funds administered by the State, as well as the corporate interests of owners, played a preponderant role in financing the commercial press. Political-economic agreements with whoever held public power and cross-subsidies from the company itself were a central part of the financial tripod that generally maintained journalism (2017, p. 21).

Several studies sought to explain how the crisis mainly affected business models and production structures (Brandstetter & Schmalhofer, 2014; Doyle, 2013; Gómez & Louzada, 2017; Ihlström Eriksson, Akesson, & Lund, 2016; Picard, 2014; Rothmann & Koch, 2014; Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015) and its financial impacts (Angelucci & Cagé, 2016; Godoy & Ospina, 2014; van der Burg & Van den Bulck, 2017). In a media ecosystem cataloged as ubiquitous (Ihlström Eriksson et al., 2016), there are those who describe this period as the reinvention of the media through multiplatform businesses (Doyle, 2013). For Doyle “[the] characteristic of

this change is the way that content decisions increasingly are being shaped, right from the outset, by the potential to generate consumer value and returns through multiple forms of expression of that content and via a range of distributive outlets” (2013, p. 17). Following Schumpeter’s concept of creative destruction, Schlesinger and Doyle (2015) describe how the shift to digital in the *Financial Times* and *The Telegraph* had important consequences for the organization of production, arguing that the use of data analytics reshaped the stories that are told. As a financial analyst at the *Financial Times* put it: “I can see through our analytics exactly what...people are doing on the site and am actually understanding their behaviour and their needs...and judge from their behaviour as to which parts we can improve, and that leads to product innovation” (Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015, p. 9). However, for the authors, the traditional routines and values linked to the production of the printed newspaper continue to exert a strong influence (Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015).

Based on changes in business models, the researchers also examined the implications for news and media content (Beckers et al., 2017; Brandstetter & Schmalhofer, 2014; De La Torre & Dillon, 2012; García Rubio, 2013; Hofstetter & Schoenhagen, 2017). Brandstetter and Schmalhofer (2014) analyzed the implementation of the paywall in the German newspaper *Die Welt* and found that there was no differentiated content strategy nor “greater use of the possibilities offered by the Internet: it does not use (s) multimedia, hypertextuality (nor) interactivity” (2014, p. 505). The findings of Bachmann and Harlow (2012) are in the same vein. For the researchers, in 2012, only a few Latin American newspapers had taken advantage of the multimedia and interactive potential of the Internet:

[there is an] abundance of photographs –non textual content par excellence– and shortage of videos, audio clips, image galleries or infographics, present each in less than 10% of the stories. Also, less than one fifth of the articles included hyperlinks in the body of the story and less than half offered links to related stories (2012, p. 227).

In this regard, commercial imperatives, along with the norms of web journalism characterized mainly by speed, mean that “on many occasions, the content is replicated or shortened between the different communication channels of the newspapers” (Barredo-Ibáñez et al., 2017, p. 16) showing a “quasi-interactive behavior” (Barredo-Ibáñez et al., 2017, p. 287), in which the residual strategies of the traditional press prevail. Surprisingly, even in the context of crisis, the findings of Beckers and colleagues (2017) indicate that there does not appear to be a negative impact on content diversity over time. These findings coincide with those of Retegui, although for the author:

The problem is not the metric system per se (...) What generates tension among journalists is the clash between logic based exclusively on what algorithms dictate and that based on newsworthy criteria. This relates to the professional culture of newsrooms, the characteristics of cultural industries (producing news is not mass production, as in other economic sectors) and the tendency to evaluate the journalist's profession in quantifiable terms, centered on creative work, even in the age of data (2020, p. 62).

In this tension between tradition and change (Mitchelstein & Boczkowski, 2009, p. 575), there are also rejections towards digital transformation and attempts to keep the printed newspaper industry as intact as possible. Godoy and Ospina (2014) reviewed the printed newspaper market in Colombia and found that, between 2006 and 2012, several indicators of financial and economic efficiency showed positive signs, such as growth in sales. Another reason to explain the attachment to the traditional model can be synthesized in the symbolic value of the newspaper compared to other digital competitors. As Villi and Hayashi argue:

Paper printing is also an advantage and symbol for the Japanese newspapers, especially against the global online giants such as Google, Yahoo and Facebook that are purely digital in their content offering. Printing is the one thing of their own that the legacy media news papers can identify themselves with (2017, p. 972).

In conclusion, the economic dimension of the crisis calls on news organizations to rethink their internal structure, to understand and think about new business models and financial structures. The new strategies impact not only internally, but also on the content offered to readers. However, the decisions are marked by a transition period that still shows a high level of rejection of technology and, therefore, the refusal to accept that the traditional paper model may disappear.

The labor manifestations of the crisis

Regarding labor issues, some researchers have examined how journalists' professional values could be affected by an alleged loss of autonomy and precarious working conditions due to administrative control and economic pressure (Bardan, 2015; Evans, 2016 ; Goyanes & Rodríguez-Castro, 2018; Hofstetter & Schoenhagen, 2017; Reich, 2018; Sarrimo, 2017). In Latin America, where journalism has been vulnerable to external interests, with mercantile and partisan logics, "the professionalizing project, beyond its supports and achievements, is in crisis" (Waisbord 2017, p. 24). For Sarrimo (2017) there is a paradigm shift that makes institutionalized journalism a "packing industry" ruled by "industrial logic and economic rationality" (2017, p. 6).

“Another main factor leading to the loss of autonomy is the ‘industrialisation’ of page production, the goal being to get rid of the manual editing of pages. Instead, readymade formats and modules serve as the guidelines when writing an article or review”, she says (2017, p. 6). Hofstetter & Schoenhagen (2017) found that, even when the spatial integration of the editorial team improves cooperation and synergies in different areas, commercial imperatives have a negative impact on the creative potential of media production and content quality. As a reaction to the crisis, some journalists “choose to leave the profession, others are transformed out of necessity and not by choice as part-time journalists or freelancers” (Bardan, 2015, p. 35).

In parallel, other studies have analyzed how the prevalence of layoffs and closings of newsrooms has caused a feeling of job insecurity and dissatisfaction among journalists (Cohen, 2015; Davidson & Meyers, 2016; Meyers & Davidson, 2014, 2016; O'Donnell, Zion, & Sherwood, 2016; Sarrimo, 2017; Siapera et al., 2015). For Meyers and Davidson, the crisis manifests itself in an occupational sensation of “passive resignation” or indecision that leads journalists to consider alternative occupations (2014, p. 1002). The authors explain that “in the context of the conceptual debate on journalism professionalism and in the context of the current crisis in the journalism industry, our findings stress that, rather than being an emerging profession, journalism could actually be a profession in decline” (Meyers & Davidson, 2014, p. 994). However, even in this context of crisis, journalists have been able to develop critiques to the situation that serve to think about possible solutions and interventions. For Siapera et al. (2015), “the formulation of these critiques shows that the field has moved from the moment of the crisis itself towards the elaboration of new possibilities for a different reality. While these may differ in their estimations and particulars, they are clearly formulated and internally consistent, while moreover, they directly feed into journalistic practices”.

For several researchers, these experiences described contribute to the constant redefinition of the limits of the profession, such as the rise of entrepreneurship (Alvear & Mellado, 2018; Ananny & Crawford, 2015; Beckers et al., 2017; Conboy & Eldridge, 2014; Graves & Konieczna, 2015; Schmitz Weiss, by Macedo Higgins Joyce, Harlow, & Alves, 2018; Wahl-Jorgensen, 2018). For Conboy and Eldridge (2014) the traces of a new type of journalism that does not neglect its traditional values and its civic role, but that at the same time is more reflective and engages with its audiences, are evident:

Present in these discourses is a mixture of journalism defending its societal and civic necessity in response to inquiry, a more open journalism that engages with an audience of citizens and the new opportunities they provide (...) These elements indicate a reinvigoration of a classic and idealised self-perception of journalism (p.8).

Schmitz Weiss and colleagues (2018) examined different news ventures in Latin America and concluded that journalistic innovation can be conceptualized “as a product through new forms of storytelling, as well as a process through collaborations with others and community engagement practices” (p. 96). However, the question of whether these innovative organizations will be able to sustain themselves over time and, eventually, solve the problems of the loss of journalism values and sustain an independent agenda remains to be answered (Schmitz Weiss et al., 2018; Zuluaga Trujillo & Gómez Montero, 2019).

In short, the industry crisis acts directly on the definition of the profession; the news, as an industrial product, begins to be governed by the values of a period marked by speed and circulation. In response, surviving journalists look for exit alternatives, inside or outside the news organizations, which in many cases leads them to work in precarious conditions ruled by commercial imperatives. However, digital tools and new formats also contribute to the consolidation of a more reflective type of journalism that currently knows much more about who it is speaking to and how to do it.

Social impact and consumption practices

Studies have also analyzed the social impact of the newspaper crisis on institutional dynamics, media ownership, responsibility, and public trust (Conboy & Eldridge, 2014; Cornia, 2016; Fang, 2017; Goyanes & Rodríguez-Castro, 2018; Hassid & Repnikova, 2016; Mor & Reich, 2018; Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015; Starke, Naab, & Scherer, 2016). Other research has also examined the intersection of institutional and consumer processes when addressing transformations in the relationships between journalists and the audience (Carlson & Usher, 2016; Holton, Coddington, & Gil de Zúñiga, 2013; Johnson & Kelling, 2018; Mellado, Márquez-Ramírez, Mick, Oller Alonso, & Olivera 2017; Nelson, 2018; Wadbring & Bergström, 2017).

On the one hand, several studies agree that technological changes per se do not constitute a source of pluralism in the industry nor do they ensure the press autonomy (Ananny, 2014; Becerra, 2015; Cornia, 2016; Doyle, 2015; Fang, 2017; Goyanes & Rodríguez-Castro, 2018; Porto, 2010); on the contrary, in some cases they appear as an obstacle. For Cornia (2016), who assesses the impact of the digital transition on the structure of the Italian market, although “the digital transition entails fewer technological barriers to enter the news field [...] market barriers and, above all, political barriers still make it difficult for newcomers to enter and consolidate” (2016, p. 191). Therefore, the autonomy of the press, according to Ananny:

depends upon how journalists navigate an emerging set of outside-in and inside-out forces –*e.g.*, how they let readers interact with online news content and generate content for publication, and how they meet audiences in new social media spaces. It seems, though, in at least the official policies regulating news workers' use of social network sites, that news organizations are adopting utilitarian, defensive, and fundamentally conservative relationships to audiences – continuing to seek freedom *from* readers (2014, p. 948).

On the other hand, research highlights the potential benefits that the link between technology and media institutions can generate, since technology plays a transversal role in the industry (García-Avilés, Carvajal-Prieto, Arias-Robles, & De Lara-González, 2019). For Hassid and Repnikova, the link that journalists from printed newspapers and Internet-based newspapers establish in China is “symbiotic”, since “unlike Western countries, where media generally manage their own financial survival, in China, all traditional media are still owned by the Party/state” (2016, p. 892). In that same vein, Nelson (2018) proposes to think about a more *participatory* link between the media, the Internet and the audiences; something that favors the control of State activities or that can have a positive impact on reducing and controlling corruption (Starke et al., 2016).

The study by Starke et al. “supports hopes that free media fulfill their tasks to hold public officials accountable, to create a more transparent society, to deter corrupt actors from illegal action by increasing the risk of detection, and to reinforce anticorruption laws” (2016, p. 4713). Meanwhile, these links also impact the internal structure of news companies, giving it greater agility and an experimental attitude in the organizational culture (Carlson & Usher, 2016).

Regarding the role that technology plays in relation to trust in the media (Chadha & Koliska, 2015; Fang, 2017; Holton et al., 2013), a study by Mor and Reich (2018) proposes to analyze the case from DocumentCloud, a platform that encourages journalists to publish documents and information that support their stories. For the authors, the platform provides transparency to journalism by publicizing the evidence, expanding the information and inviting the audience to participate in the verification of the information, something that “might help restore the deteriorating public trust in the news media, if implemented on a broader scale” (Mor & Reich, 2018, p. 1103). However, Fang (2017) states that, in certain contexts, digital technologies can also show their “dark side” by playing an important role in promoting distrust and attacks on journalists by enabling “the trolling and harassment (...) and promoting the visibility and popularity of the more vocal and radical attackers in the community” (2017, p. 59).

This tension is also reflected in the emergence of alternative channels and new narratives (Robledo-Dioses & Atarama-Rojas, 2018; Starbird, 2017) and the role of social networks in their distribution (Budak, 2019; Johnson & Kelling, 2018; Starbird, 2017). The latter author describes how news from these alternative media circulate and are related to the spread of fake news and conspiracy theories and pseudo-sciences, which ultimately function as promoters of underlying political agendas. “The structure and dynamics of the alternative media ecosystem provide evidence of [the] intentional disinformation tactics designed not to spread a specific ideology, but to undermine trust in information in general” (Starbird, 2017, p. 239). This coincides with what Budak (2019) proposes, who explains that during the 2016 presidential elections in the United States, individuals reported having seen, read or heard information that aligns more with the fake news agenda media than with that of traditional media. For the author, this is partly explained by a “similarity between the popular topics for fake and traditional news domain”, but when analyzing the treatment of political issues it is seen that the traditional media did so weakly, focused on covering the scandals of the candidates (Budak, 2019, p. 148). However, the emergence of alternative channels can also bring with it the exploration of new transmedia narratives that could be an opportunity for the reinvention of journalism in the region (Fernández Castrillo, 2014; Renó, 2011; Albarello, 2013). As Robledo-Dioses and Ataram Rojas propose:

journalism faces different audiences with very different characteristics, which implies that the traditional generalist process of production and dissemination of information is already out of date and must be replaced by a narrative process that has the user as its center and that, in turn, does not neglect the quality of the content (2018, p. 124).

As a result of the above, the crisis in the industry can be understood from the changes that occur in the insertion social dynamics of news organizations. Technology, far from becoming a factor that can undoubtedly grant plurality to information, has a crucial role in defining the link between the press and citizens. In the constant redefinition of the traditional values of the press and trust in the traditional news media, new narratives emerge that question how information is produced and circulated in these times.

Finally, although to a lesser extent, some specialists have focused on understanding what changes occur in the information consumption and how this is affected by the crisis of the printed newspaper: who is consuming news, how they are consuming it, and where are they doing it are the main questions posed by the studies (Albarello 2020; Bipat, Wilson, Kurniawan, Choi, & Starbird, 2019; Chyi & Tenenboim, 2019; Nelson, 2018; Papathanassopoulos et al., 2013;

Pellegrini, Bradley, Swift, & Boals, 2015; Thurman, 2018; Thurman & Fletcher, 2019; Wadbring & Bergström, 2017).

The discussion centered mainly around the decline in newspaper reading, especially among young people. Thurman and Fletcher (2019) analyze the British case by means of the evolution of the time spent on eleven news platforms, which shows a notorious 40% drop in the time spent on newspapers in recent years. “This reduction took place even though online distribution lowered the costs of content consumption, both in financial terms—by providing free access in many cases—and with respect to convenience and speed” (2019, p. 14). According to Wadbring & Bergström (2017), the drop in readership of printed newspapers is independent of whether or not we include web editions, and the explanation seems to be generational. For the authors, “the younger generations tend to abandon printed newspapers regardless of their cost” (2017, p. 185). However, all generations have increased their consumption of news on television, although only modestly among the younger generations, demonstrated by the stability of the audience over time (Wadbring & Bergström, 2017). In this context, Papathanassopoulos et al. conclude that even though the Internet has changed all communication by giving people more sources of information, television is still the most popular news option. This suggests that people choose between TV, newspapers or the web to have “parallel news content” (Papathanassopoulos et al., 2013, p. 701). In Latin America, this can also be partly explained by the increase in the circulation of free printed newspapers (Bakker, 2012). García Rubio (2013) states that, in Mexico, “the newspapers with the greatest circulation are those that are popular, free and some of general information. It can be inferred that the Mexican readership has opted for an inexpensive or free press, which is associated with low quality standards” (p. 90).

THEORETICAL AND METHODOLOGICAL APPROACHES

Research on the press crisis has been heterogeneous in terms of their conceptual approaches and the set of techniques used. The highlights will be briefly described below. Researchers have framed their analyzes particularly in the understanding of the media business models (Brandstetter & Schmalhofer, 2014; Doyle, 2013; Ihlström Eriksson et al., 2016; Kolo, 2016; Picard, 2014; van der Burg & Van den Bulck, 2017) to understand, in many cases, the digital transition that several of these news institutions are undergoing (Rothmann & Koch, 2014; Villi & Hayashi, 2017). Other researchers have conceptualized the phenomenon from the *sociological turn* of the media economy (Schlesinger & Doyle, 2015). In this regard, sociology has been predominant with different angles: from the perspective of the labor sociology (Ekdale, Tully, Harmsen, & Singer, 2015) to institutional sociology and

organizational behavior (Ananny, 2014; Ananny & Crawford, 2015; Davidson & Meyers, 2016; Graves & Konieczna, 2015). An innovative look is that of Usher (2015), who places his research from the social and cultural theory of space to analyze how labor dynamics change in the writing of a newspaper in Miami. Those who have addressed the possible impact of the crisis of the written press in the public sphere and democracy have preferred conceptual approaches, from the political economy of the media and political communication (Cornia, 2016; Retegui, 2013; Starke et al., 2016). The new horizons of the press, its values and dynamics have also been conceptualized from journalism studies (Ananny, 2014; Bachmann & Harlow, 2012; Hassid & Repnikova, 2016; Mor & Reich, 2018).

As for the techniques and methods used, there is a predominance of case studies to. For example, to describe how the crisis affects journalists' perceptions, work dynamics and links with audiences, research has turned to the life stories of reporters (Davidson & Meyers, 2016), to in-depth interviews (Ananny & Crawford, 2015; Bardan, 2015; De La Torre & Dillon, 2012; Gómez & Louzada, 2017; Sarrimo, 2017; Villi & Hayashi, 2017), to a lesser extent to surveys (O'Donnell et al., 2016), to ethnographies (Boczowski et al., 2019; Graves & Konieczna, 2015; Usher, 2015), and to focus groups (Schmitz Weiss et al., 2018). Retegui (2020) combined an ethnographic approach within the newsroom of the newspaper *La Nación* in Argentina with in-depth interviews and bibliographic analysis to get to know the impact of digital news measurement indicators on journalistic work.

Although it is a less frequently used technique, textual and content approaches have also served as fruitful methodological tools in the field (Alvear & Mellado, 2018; Ananny, 2014; Bachmann & Harlow, 2012; Brandstetter & Schmalhofer, 2014; Carlson & Usher, 2016; Conboy & Eldridge, 2014; Mor & Reich, 2018; Starbird, 2017). For example, Bachmann and Harlow (2012) conducted a content analysis of nineteen newspapers in Latin America to understand how these media are responding to new multimedia demands. Some years later, Barredo-Ibáñez and Díaz-Cerveró (2017) also carried out a content analysis to evaluate, based on a series of quality indicators, the interactivity in Colombian, Mexican and Ecuadorian cybermedia.

Finally, longitudinal and transnational studies have been used to a lesser extent (Schmitz Weiss et al., 2018; Starke et al., 2016; van der Burg & Van den Bulck, 2017). The work conducted by Schmitz Weiss et al. (2018) stands out; to understand more about entrepreneurial news organizations in the region, they conducted focus groups with participants from Argentina, Brazil, Chile, El Salvador, Mexico, Nicaragua, Peru, and Venezuela. Through the use and analysis of secondary quantitative data, other studies propose a perspective that allows the comparison and delimitation of the phenomenon in a broader sense. For example, in their study

on the impact of freedom of expression, Internet access, and the provision of online government services on corruption, Starke, Naab, and Scherer (2016) analyze and compare the results in 157 countries over the years 2003, 2008 and 2013.

TOWARDS A LATIN AMERICAN UNDERSTANDING OF THE PRINTED PRESS CRISIS

So far, we have reviewed the recent literature on the crisis of the printed newspaper, its main thematic declines and methodological approaches. In this section, we will describe a possible agenda that contemplates the strengths of the researches examined, but also how possible limitations can be overcome considering the particular Latin American perspective and experience.

It is worth noting that, in most researches, the question about the future of journalism and the printed press has been circumscribed to a limited timeframe that revolves around specific cases. In other words, the research objects have shifted from *what would happen if ...* – a rather widespread concern since the advent of the Internet– to focus on what has actually happened or is happening in a given territory. The researches cited are based mainly on cases with specific questions, which address specific events (moves, layoffs, changes in business strategies, drops in circulation, media closures, among others) and that, to a lesser extent, are predictive of the future. The crisis is no longer a threat; on the contrary, it becomes part of the daily life of the media.

However, the specific question and the case analyzes leave open the opportunity to obtain systematic knowledge that allows more complex multidimensional comparisons and analyzes. From this perspective, a way to make sense of individual findings should consider the inclusion of a historical view that considers changes in perceptions and discourses with comparable parameters over time and in different territories. As we have seen so far, most studies collect data from a single source of information. When researches have two or more sources, they are generally used in a complementary way to the first. For the Latin American case, this may be due in part to the difficulty of having systematic and reliable data, as García Rubio explains for Mexico where:

So far it has not been possible to create an exhaustive national and state index of publications, nor to have clear figures on the press circulation. Regarding the latter, several researchers have highlighted the obscurantism in print runs, questioning the reliability of the circulation figures and print runs (2013, p. 69).

From the point of view of the dimensions of analysis, much has been written about the productive dimensions of the press and less has been investigated about

the reception, with valuable exceptions (Focás et al., 2016; Boczkowski et al., 2019; Mastrini et al., 2014; Albarello 2020). It is necessary to ask what happens in the consumption of information and what role media (whether printed or digital) have in the broader context of media consumption and, of course, in people's daily lives. We could then affirm that the term *crisis* is a concept or a situation that has only interested industry and academia. Although there is increasing research that looks into the consumption of news on digital platforms (Mitchelstein & Boczkowski, 2009), the lack of research that focuses on understanding information consumption –and printed news, specifically– from the lens of individual and collective practices suggests that, for audiences it is probably less a crisis and more new experiences (or mutations of some pre-existing ones) in the consumption of information.

The literature on the crisis of the written press has been constantly innovative in its incorporation of information from business and advertising, especially to address how new digital-based businesses work, adding complex econometric models to understand the profitability of media companies, but studies on printed newspaper consumption remain anchored to what Couldry (2012) calls media-centrism. In other words, these researches have focused on the dimensions that derive from the media, as technological devices, forgetting in many cases what happens in people's daily lives. Regarding this, some recent works are reorienting the conceptual and theoretical approaches to understand what happens at the *material* intersection between the technological device, information, and daily practices (Boczkowski et al., 2019; Fortunati, Taipale, & Farinosi, 2015 ; Kormelink & Meijer, 2019). Beyond explaining the crisis, what these researches propose are new hypotheses that explore the reasons why people continue to consume printed newspapers, the reasons and contexts that underlie highly habitual practices.

Finally, evidence suggests that a comparative perspective is necessary to address the crisis. The researches described here are mostly focused on the Northern Hemisphere, specifically the United States. However, based on some works described in this study (Bachmann & Harlow, 2012; Barrios, 2010; Schmitz Weiss et al., 2018) the feasibility of building comparative scenarios in Latin America is clear, in part due to academic collaboration of researchers in the region.

Considering this, even though it is still extremely complex to define the empirical indicators to evaluate the changes and impacts of the press on democracy (Schudson, 2010), it is important to continue exploring the link that the press, journalism and the media have, or may have, in the formation of civic responsibility and a strengthening of democratic values (Porto & Hallin, 2009; Rojas, 2006) in contexts where media ownership concentration dominates the scene (Becerra & Mastrini, 2017).

CONCLUSION

We begun this paper with two objectives: the first, to discuss how academia, since the publication of Siles and Boczkowski (2012), has addressed the crisis of the printed newspapers in the last decade. Based on this, we showed their thematic approaches, namely economic, labor, and social, and we described their perspectives and theoretical and methodological limitations. The second objective, which arises from the systematization of the literature on the subject, was to elucidate opportunities and offer a possible framework and agenda to address the problem from Latin America, considering the scarce, although very relevant, participation in the discussion.

The researches here analyzed reveal two fundamental facts; in the first place, a divergence in the approach to the object: the crisis of the newspaper and the consumption of information are strongly characterized by researchers in their informational dimension, and organized according to the media as technological devices. On the other side there are the practices of consumption and appropriation of these media by audiences in their daily lives. This divergence between the media and audiences could illuminate new research questions that revolve around their imbrication in social life, such as: What links emerge between the ways of accessing news (paper, digital, television, radio, others) and consumer practices in everyday life? From that: What rituals are circumscribed and shape the experience of news consumption in the region? Also, how do audiences perceive strategy shifts and media transitions? What broader social dynamics allow us to characterize the ways we consume news today?

Second, the topic of the press crisis has been profusely addressed by researchers in the Northern Hemisphere, especially in the United States and Europe. Using a bridge metaphor, it is necessary to build one that connects the experiences of the newspaper crisis in other territories with those findings and particularities of developed countries. Latin America is a region in which printed newspapers have a centuries-old tradition: they have played a fundamental role from independence (Piccato, 2010) to nowadays. However, the region's heterogeneity, as well as the relatively recent democratization and economic instability, can redefine both the context and the consequences of the press crisis. In turn, examining the differences between the decline of printed newspapers in industrialized democracies and in developing countries will lead to a more complete understanding of this transition as a whole.

Finally, this paper aims to function as an articulator of what up to now have been two worlds. Specifically, it looks to serve as a driver for new research based on what is already known in a context in which research in the field of communication is

experiencing a time of both institutional and disciplinary globalization (Waisbord, 2019), but where also methodological and conceptual frameworks are challenged, contested and rewritten to account for the Latin American press peculiarities.

REFERENCES

- Albarello, F. (2013). Carlos Scolari. Narrativas transmedia. Cuando todos los medios cuentan: Barcelona, Deusto, 2013, 342 pp. ISBN 978-84-234-1336-2 (Carlos Scolari. Transmedia narratives. When all the media count). *Austral Comunicación*, 2(2), 247-249. <https://doi.org/10.26422/aucom.2013.0202.alba>
- Albarello, F. (2020). De la hegemonía al nicho: desplazamiento de medios tradicionales en rutinas informativas de un grupo de universitarios argentinos (From hegemony to the niche: displacement of traditional media in informative routines of a group of Argentine university students). *Dixit*, (32), 46-60. <https://doi.org/10.22235/d.vi32.1946>
- Alvear, L. & Mellado, C. (2018). La presencia de rol cívico, de servicio y de infoentretenimiento en las noticias de cultura y espectáculos del periodismo chileno (The Presence of Civic, Service and Infotainment Roles in the News about Culture and Show Business of Chilean Journalism). *Palabra Clave*, 21(2), 338-363. <https://doi.org/10.5294/pacla.2018.21.2.4>
- Ananny, M. (2014). Networked Press Freedom and Social Media: Tracing Historical and Contemporary Forces in Press-Public Relations. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 19(4), 938-956. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jcc4.12076>
- Ananny, M. & Crawford, K. (2015). A Liminal Press: Situating news app designers within a field of networked news production. *Digital Journalism*, 3(2), 192-208. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2014.922322>
- Anderson, B. (2006). *Imagined communities: Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso books.
- Angelucci, C. & Cagé, J. (2016). Newspapers in times of low advertising revenues. *Centre for Economic Policy Research*, DP11414. Retrieved from <https://portal.cepr.org/discussion-paper/357>
- Bachmann, I. & Harlow, S. (2012). Interactivity and multimedia in Latin American newspapers: Inroads in an incomplete transition. *Cuadernos.info*, (30), 41-52. Retrieved from <https://cuadernos.info/index.php/CDI/article/view/421/pdf>
- Bakker, P. (2012). The rise of free daily newspapers in Latin America. *Revista de comunicación*, (11), 129-149. Retrieved from <https://revistadecomunicacion.com/es/articulos/2012/Art129-149.html>
- Bardan, A. (2015). The Dual Model of the Digital Photojournalist: A Case Study on Romanian Photojournalism beyond the Economic Crisis. *Journal of Media Research - Revista de Studii Media*, 8(21), 19-40. Retrieved from <https://www.ceeol.com/search/article-detail?id=6792>
- Barredo-Ibáñez, D., Díaz-Cerveró, E., Garzón, K. T. P., del Rosario Gómez, R., Pérez, S., Nava, F. E., ... & Estrada, L. G. (2017). La interactividad en el periodismo digital latinoamericano. Un análisis de los principales cybermedios de Colombia, México y Ecuador (2016) (Interactivity in Latin American digital journalism. An analysis of the main cybermedia of Colombia, Mexico and Ecuador (2016)). *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, (72), 273-294. <https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2017-1165>

- Barrios, M. M. (2010). Los diarios digitales en América Latina: entre la revolución, la redefinición y la frustración (Digital newspapers in Latin America: between revolution, redefinition and frustration). *Investigación & Desarrollo*, 15(2).
<http://rcientificas.uninorte.edu.co/index.php/investigacion/article/viewFile/887/531>
- Becerra, M. (2015). *De la concentración a la convergencia. Políticas de medios en Argentina y América Latina* (From concentration to convergence. Media policies in Argentina and Latin America). Buenos Aires: Paidós.
- Becerra, M. & Mastrini, G. (2017). Concentración y convergencia de medios en América Latina (Media concentration and convergence in Latin America). *Communiquer. Revue de communication sociale et publique*, (20), 104–120. <https://doi.org/10.4000/communiquer.2277>
- Beckers, K., Masini, A., Sevenans, J., van der Burg, M., De Smedt, J., Van den Bulck, H., & Walgrave, S. (2017). Are newspapers' news stories becoming more alike? Media content diversity in Belgium, 1983–2013. *Journalism*, 20(12), 1665–1683.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884917706860>
- Bipat, T., Wilson, T., Kurniawan, O., Choi, Y. J. S., & Starbird, K. (2019). It is Not All Fun and Games: Breaking News Consumption on Snapchat. *Proceedings of the 52nd Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences*. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10125/59649>
- Boczkowski, P. J., Mitchelstein, E., & Suenzo, F. (2019). The Smells, Sights, and Pleasures of Ink on Paper: The Consumption of Print Newspapers During a Period Marked by Their Crisis. *Journalism Studies*, 21(5), 565–581. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2019.1670092>
- Brandstetter, B. & Schmalhofer, J. (2014). Paid Content: A successful revenue model for publishing houses in Germany? *Journalism Practice*, 8(5), 499–507.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2014.895519>
- Budak, C. (2019). What Happened? The Spread of Fake News Publisher Content During the 2016 U.S. Presidential Election. *The World Wide Web Conference*, 139–150.
<https://doi.org/10.1145/3308558.3313721>
- Carlson, M. & Usher, N. (2016). News Startups as Agents of Innovation: For-profit digital news startup manifestos as metajournalistic discourse. *Digital Journalism*, 4(5), 563–581.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2015.1076344>
- Chadha, K. & Koliska, M. (2015). Newsrooms and Transparency in the Digital Age. *Journalism Practice*, 9(2), 215–229. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2014.924737>
- Chyi, H. I. & Tenenboim, O. (2019). Charging More and Wondering Why Readership Declined? A Longitudinal Study of U.S. Newspapers' Price Hikes, 2008–2016. *Journalism Studies*, 20(14), 2113–2129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2019.1568903>
- Cohen, N. S. (2015). Entrepreneurial Journalism and the Precarious State of Media Work. *The South Atlantic quarterly*, 114(3), 513–533. <https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-3130723>
- Conboy, M. & Eldridge, S. A. (2014). Morbid symptoms. Between a dying and a re-birth (apologies to Gramsci). *Journalism Studies*, 15(5), 566–575. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.894375>
- Cornia, A. (2016). TV-centrism and politicisation in Italy: obstacles to new media development and pluralism. *Media Culture & Society*, 38(2), 175–195. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443715594035>
- Couldry, N. (2012). *Media, Society, World: Social Theory and Digital Media Practice*. Polity.

- Davidson, R. & Meyers, O. (2016). "Should I Stay or Should I Go?": Exit, voice and loyalty among journalists. *Journalism Studies*, 17(5), 590–607. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.988996>
- De La Torre, L. & Dillon, A. (2012). Comunicación, redes sociales y democracia en la mirada de periodistas argentinos (Communication, Social Networks and Democracy According to Journalists in Argentina). *Cuadernos. info*, (30), 61–72. <https://doi.org/10.7764/cdi.30.423>
- Doyle, G. (2013). Re-Invention and Survival: Newspapers in the Era of Digital Multiplatform Delivery. *Journal of Media Business Studies*, 10(4), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/16522354.2013.11073569>
- Doyle, G. (2015). Why Ownership Pluralism Still Matters in a Multi-platform World. In P. Valcke, M. Sükösd, & R. G. Picard (Eds.), *Media Pluralism and Diversity: Concepts, Risks and Global Trends* (pp. 297–309). Palgrave Macmillan UK. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137304308_18
- Ekdale, B., Tully, M., Harmsen, S., & Singer, J. B. (2015). Newswork Within a Culture of Job Insecurity: Producing news amidst organizational and industry uncertainty. *Journalism Practice*, 9(3), 383–398. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2014.963376>
- Evans, S. K. (2016). Staying Ahead of the Digital Tsunami: The Contributions of an Organizational Communication Approach to Journalism in the Information Age. *The Journal of communication*, 66(2), 280–298. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12217>
- Fang, K. (2017). "Guard against fire, theft, and journalists": the public against the press in China. *Media Asia*, 44(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01296612.2017.1374628>
- Fernández Castrillo, C. (2014). Prácticas transmedia en la era del prosumidor: Hacia una definición del Contenido Generado por el Usuario (CGU) (Transmedia practices in the prosumer era: Towards a definition of User Generated Content (UGC)). *CIC. Cuadernos de información y comunicación*, 19, 53–67. https://doi.org/10.5209/rev_CIYC.2014.v19.43903
- Focás, B., Alarcón, C., Polesel, C. R., Galar, S., Del Palacio Montiel, C., Browne Mönckeberg, M., ... & Varjão, S. (2016). (In) seguridad, medios y miedos: una mirada desde las experiencias y las prácticas cotidianas en América Latina ((In) security, media and fears: a look from daily experiences and practices in Latin America). Cali, Colombia: Universidad Icesi.
- Fortunati, L., Taipale, S., & Farinosi, M. (2015). Print and online newspapers as material artefacts. *Journalism*, 16(6), 830–846. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884914545439>
- García-Avilés, J. A., Carvajal-Prieto, M., Arias-Robles, F., & De Lara-González, A. (2019). Journalists' views on innovating in the newsroom: Proposing a model of the diffusion of innovations in media outlets. *The Journal of Media Innovations*, 5(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.5617/jomi.v5i1.3968>
- García Rubio, C. I. (2013). Radiografía de la prensa diaria en México en 2010 (The daily press in Mexico in 2010). *Comunicación y sociedad*, (20), 65–93. <https://doi.org/10.32870/cys.v0i20.217>
- Godoy, J. A. R. & Ospina, A. M. P. (2014). El sector de medios impresos en Colombia (The print media industry in Colombia: an interpretation of its financial situation). *Entramado*, 10(1), 30–54. <https://revistas.unilibre.edu.co/index.php/entramado/article/view/3480>
- Gómez, E. F. R. & Louzada, C. F. (2017). ¿Es rentable el periodismo de calidad? Disposición al pago en Brasil y España (Is quality journalism profitable? Intent to pay in Brazil and Spain). *Transinformação*, 29(2), 211–220. <https://doi.org/10.1590/2318-08892017000200008>

- Gómez-Luna, E., Fernando-Navas, D., Aponte-Mayor, G., & Betancourt-Buitrago, L. A. (2014). Metodología para la revisión bibliográfica y la gestión de información de temas científicos, a través de su estructuración y sistematización (Literature review methodology for scientific and information management, through its structuring and systematization). *Dyna*, 81(184), 158–163. Retrieved from http://dyna.medellin.unal.edu.co/en/verResumenEN.php?id_articulo=v81n184a21
- Goyanes, M. & Rodríguez-Castro, M. (2018). Commercial Pressures in Spanish Newsrooms: Between love, struggle and resistance. *Journalism Studies*, 20(8), 1088–1109. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2018.1487801>
- Graves, L. & Konieczna, M. (2015). Qualitative Political Communication| Sharing the News: Journalistic Collaboration as Field Repair. *International Journal of Communication Systems*, 9, 19. Retrieved from <http://ijoc.org/index.php/ijoc/article/view/3381>
- Habermas, J. (2015). *The Theory of Communicative Action: Lifeworld and Systems, a Critique of Functionalist Reason*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Hassid, J. & Repnikova, M. (2016). Why Chinese print journalists embrace the Internet. *Journalism*, 17(7), 882–898. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884915592405>
- Hofstetter, B. & Schoenhagen, P. (2017). When Creative Potentials are Being Undermined By Commercial Imperatives: Change and resistance in six cases of newsroom reorganisation. *Digital Journalism*, 5(1), 44–60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2016.1155966>
- Holton, A. E., Coddington, M., & Gil de Zúñiga, H. (2013). Whose News? Whose Values?: Citizen journalism and journalistic values through the lens of content creators and consumers. *Journalism Practice*, 7(6), 720–737. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2013.766062>
- Ihlström Eriksson, C., Akesson, M., & Lund, J. (2016). Designing Ubiquitous Media Services: Exploring the Two-Sided Market of Newspapers. *Journal of theoretical and applied electronic commerce research*, 11(3), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-18762016000300002>
- Johnson, B. G. & Kelling, K. (2018). Placing Facebook: “Trending,” “Napalm Girl,” “fake news” and journalistic boundary work. *Journalism Practice*, 12(7), 817–833. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2017.1349546>
- Knight Center LatAm Journalism Review. (2018, mayo 6). Crisis de periódicos llega al Diario de Pernambuco, el de más antigua circulación en América Latina. *Knight Center Journalism Review*. <https://latamjournalismreview.org/es/articles/crisis-de-periodicos-llega-al-diario-de-pernambuco-el-de-mas-antigua-circulacion-en-america-latina/>
- Kolo, C. (2016). A Long-term View on the Business Model of Newspaper Publishing: International Comparison and Quantitative Modelling for Germany as Case in point. *Westminster Papers in Communication and Culture*, 11(1). <https://doi.org/10.16997/wpcc.217>
- Kormelink, T. G. & Meijer, I. C. (2019). Material and sensory dimensions of everyday news use. *Media, Culture & Society*, 41(5), 637–653. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443718810910>
- Mastrini, G., Marino, S., Becerra, M., Gadano, J., Bieda, T., Bizberge, A., Perea, R., & Rodríguez Miranda, C. (2014). *Uso y consumo de la Televisión Digital Terrestre en Argentina. Un estudio en los municipios de San Fernando y Quilmes* (Use and consumption of Digital Terrestrial Television in Argentina. A study in the municipalities of San Fernando and Quilmes). Quilmes, Argentina: Universidad Nacional de Quilmes.

- Mellado, C., Márquez-Ramírez, M., Mick, J., Oller Alonso, M., & Olivera, D. (2017). Journalistic performance in Latin America: A comparative study of professional roles in news content. *Journalism*, 18(9), 1087–1106. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884916657509>
- Meyers, O. & Davidson, R. (2014). The journalistic structure of feeling: An exploration of career life histories of Israeli journalists. *Journalism*, 15(8), 987–1005. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884913512930>
- Meyers, O. & Davidson, R. (2016). Conceptualizing Journalistic Careers: Between Interpretive Community and Tribes of Professionalism. *Sociology Compass*, 10(6), 419–431. <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12376>
- Mitchelstein, E. & Boczkowski, P. J. (2009). Between tradition and change: A review of recent research on online news production. *Journalism*, 10(5), 562–586. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884909106533>
- Mor, N. & Reich, Z. (2018). From “Trust Me” to “Show Me” Journalism: Can DocumentCloud help to restore the deteriorating credibility of news? *Journalism Practice*, 12(9), 1091–1108. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2017.1376593>
- Nelson, J. L. (2018). And Deliver Us to Segmentation: The growing appeal of the niche news audience. *Journalism Practice*, 12(2), 204–219. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2017.1378588>
- O’Donnell, P., Zion, L., & Sherwood, M. (2016). Where do journalists go after newsroom job cuts? *Journalism Practice*, 10(1), 35–51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2015.1017400>
- Papathanassopoulos, S., Coen, S., Curran, J., Aalberg, T., Rowe, D., Jones, P., Rojas, H., & Tiffen, R. (2013). Online Threat, But Television is Still Dominant: A comparative study of 11 nations’ news consumption. *Journalism Practice*, 7(6), 690–704. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2012.761324>
- Pellegrini, P., Bradley, D., Swift, K., & Boals, T. (2015). Cross Platform Media Measurement: Mobile and Desktop Online Measurement Comparisons. Paper presented at the Print and Digital Research Forum 2015, London. Retrieved from https://www.pdrf.net/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/10_Syn43Pellegrini.pdf
- Picard, R. G. (2014). Twilight or New Dawn of Journalism?: Evidence from the changing news ecosystem. *Journalism Practice*, 8(5), 488–498. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17512786.2014.905338>
- Piccato, P. (2010). Public sphere in Latin America: a map of the historiography. *Social History*, 35(2), 165–192. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03071021003795055>
- Porto, M. P. (2010). The changing landscape of Brazil’s news media. In D.A. Levy & R. Kleis Nielsen (Eds.), *The changing business of journalism and its implications for democracy* (pp. 107–124). Oxford, UK: Reuters Institute. Retrieved from <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2017-11/The%20Changing%20Business%20of%20Journalism%20and%20its%20Implications%20for%20Democracy.pdf#page=113>
- Porto, M. P. & Hallin, D. C. (2009). Media and Democratization in Latin America. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 14(3), 291–295. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161209336231>
- Reich, Z. (2018). The decline in orally negotiated news: Revisiting (again) the role of technology in reporting. *New Media & Society*, 20(11), 4116–4134. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444818768064>
- Renó, D. P. (2011). Periodismo, redes sociales y transmediación (Journalism, social networks and transmedia). *Razón y palabra*, 16(78).

- Retegui, L. M. (2013). La caída constante en las ventas del diario Clarín (1995-2012). Un análisis desde la economía política de la comunicación (The constant drop in sales of the newspaper Clarín (1995-2012). An analysis from the political economy of communication). *Razón y Palabra*, 18(84).
- Retegui, L. (2020). Métricas y cuantificación del rendimiento individual de los periodistas (Metrics and the quantification of individual journalistic performance: a study into the heart of a newsroom). *Austral Comunicación*, 9(1), 45-67. <https://doi.org/10.26422/aucom.2020.0901.ret>
- Robledo-Dioses, K. & Atarama-Rojas, T. (2018). Periodismo transmedia y consumo mediático de la generación millennials (Transmedia journalism and media consumption of the millennial generation). *Anagramas*, 17(33), 105-127. <https://doi.org/10.22395/angr.v17n33a5>
- Rojas, H. (2006). Comunicación, participación y democracia (Communication, participation and democracy). *Universitas*, (62), 109-142. http://www.scielo.org.co/scielo.php?pid=S0120-48072006000200006&script=sci_arttext&tlng=en
- Rothmann, W. & Koch, J. (2014). Creativity in strategic lock-ins: The newspaper industry and the digital revolution. *Technological forecasting and social change*, 83, 66-83. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2013.03.005>
- Sarrimo, C. (2017). The press crisis and its impact on Swedish arts journalism: Autonomy loss, a shifting paradigm and a “journalistification” of the profession. *Journalism: Theory, Practice & Criticism*, 18(6), 664-679. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884915625629>
- Schlesinger, P. & Doyle, G. (2015). From organizational crisis to multi-platform salvation? Creative destruction and the recomposition of news media. *Journalism*, 16(3), 305-323. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884914530223>
- Schmitz Weiss, A., de Macedo Higgins Joyce, V., Harlow, S., & Alves, R. C. (2018). Innovation and Sustainability: A Relationship Examined among Latin American Entrepreneurial News Organizations. *Cuadernos. info*, (42), 87-100. <https://doi.org/10.7764/cdi.42.1266>
- Schudson, M. (2010). News in crisis in the United States: panic—and beyond. In D. A. Levy & R. Klein Nielsen (Eds.), *The changing business of journalism and its implications for democracy* (pp. 95-106). Oxford, UK: Reuters Institute. Retrieved from <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2017-11/The%20Changing%20Business%20of%20Journalism%20and%20its%20Implications%20for%20Democracy.pdf#page=101>
- Siapera, E., Papadopoulou, L., & Archontakis, F. (2015). Post-Crisis Journalism: Critique and renewal in Greek journalism. *Journalism Studies*, 16(3), 449-465. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2014.916479>
- Siles, I. & Boczkowski, P. J. (2012). Making sense of the newspaper crisis: A critical assessment of existing research and an agenda for future work. *New Media and Society*, 14(8), 1375-1394. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444812455148>
- SINCA. (s. f.). Circulación neta diaria (4 principales diarios y resto de los diarios) (Daily net circulation (4 main newspapers and the rest of the newspapers)) (data set). Retrieved from <https://www.sinca.gob.ar/DatosBasicosSeries.aspx?Id=77>
- Starbird, K. (2017). Examining the alternative media ecosystem through the production of alternative narratives of mass shooting events on Twitter. In *Proceedings of the AAAI Conference on Web and Social Media 2017* (pp. 230-239). AAAI. <https://www.aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICWSM/ICWSM17/paper/viewPaper/15603>

- Starke, C., Naab, T. K., & Scherer, H. (2016). Free to Expose Corruption: The Impact of Media Freedom, Internet Access and Governmental Online Service Delivery on Corruption. *International Journal of Communication*, 10, 4702-4722. Retrieved from <http://ijoc.org/index.php/ijoc/article/view/5712>
- Thurman, N. (2018). Newspaper Consumption in the Mobile Age: Re-assessing multi-platform performance and market share using “time-spent”. *Journalism Studies*, 19(10), 1409-1429. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1279028>
- Thurman, N. & Fletcher, R. (2019). Has Digital Distribution Rejuvenated Readership?: Revisiting the age demographics of newspaper consumption. *Journalism Studies*, 20(4), 542-562. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1397532>
- Usher, N. (2015). Newsroom moves and the newspaper crisis evaluated: space, place, and cultural meaning. *Media Culture & Society*, 37(7), 1005-1021. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443715591668>
- van der Burg, M. & Van den Bulck, H. (2017). Why are traditional newspaper publishers still surviving in the digital era? The impact of long-term trends on the Flemish newspaper industry’s financing, 1990-2014. *Journal of Media Business Studies*, 14(2), 82-115. <https://doi.org/10.1080/16522354.2017.1290024>
- Verón, E. (2013). *La semiosis social, 2: ideas, momentos, interpretantes* (Social semiosis, 2: ideas, moments, interpreters). Barcelona, Spain: Paidós.
- Víctima de la crisis en Brasil, cerró el periódico Jornal do Commercio (Victim of the crisis in Brazil, the newspaper Jornal do Commercio closed). (2016, April 30). *Infobae*. Retrieved from <https://www.infobae.com>
- Villi, M. & Hayashi, K. (2017). “The Mission is to Keep this Industry Intact”: Digital transition in the Japanese newspaper industry. *Journalism Studies*, 18(8), 960-977. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2015.1110499>
- Wadbring, I. & Bergström, A. (2017). A Print Crisis or a Local Crisis?: Local news use over three decades. *Journalism Studies*, 18(2), 175-190. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2015.1042988>
- Wahl-Jorgensen, K. (2018). Challenging presentism in journalism studies: An emotional life history approach to understanding the lived experience of journalists. *Journalism*, 20(5), 670-678. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1464884918760670>
- Waisbord, S. (2017). Crisis y posprofesionalismo en el periodismo contemporáneo (Crisis and post-professionalism in contemporary journalism). In E. Miltchensein & P. Boczkowski (Comps)., *Titulares, hashtags y videojuegos. La comunicación en la era digital* (Headlines, hashtags and video games. Communication in the digital age) (pp. 17-34). Buenos Aires: Manantial.
- Waisbord, S. (2019). *Communication: A Post- Discipline*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Zuluaga Trujillo, J. & Gómez Montero, S. (2019). Medios nativos digitales en América Latina: agenda, sostenimiento e influencia (Digital Native Media in Latin America: Agenda, Sustainability and Influence). *Chasqui. Revista Latinoamericana de Comunicación*, 1(141), 301-316. <https://doi.org/10.16921/chasqui.v0i141.3333>

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

FACUNDO SUENZO, estudiante de doctorado en Medios, Tecnología y Sociedad en la Universidad de Northwestern (EE.UU.), donde también es afiliado al Center for Latinx Digital Media.

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4757-1850>

PABLO J. BOCZKOWSKI, Hamad Bin Khalifa Al-Thani Professor en el Departamento de Estudios de la Comunicación de Northwestern University (EE.UU.).

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9446-8303>

EUGENIA MITCHELSTEIN, profesora asociada en la Universidad de San Andrés.

 <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7355-8740>